

Neutrino forces and where to find them Walter Tangarife



Collaborators: Mitrajyoti Ghosh, Yuval Grossman, Xunjie Xu, and Bingrong Yu

> PRD 101 (2020) 11, 116006 JHEP 02 (2023) 092



Preparing people to lead extraordinary lives

Supported by NSF grants PHY-2013052 PHY-2310224



Motivation



V(r) is computed by taking the Fourier transform of the amplitude. The range of the force is given by the location of the branch cut in the matrix element in the t-plane.

Motivation

A pair of massless neutrinos mediate a long-range force via one-loop diagrams



At leading order
$$V(r) = \frac{G_F^2}{4\pi^3 r^5}$$



At distances larger than 1 nm, this force is weaker than the gravitational force between two protons

Motivation

A pair of massless neutrinos mediate a long-range force via one-loop diagrams



At leading order $V(r) = \frac{G_F^2}{4\pi^3 r^5}$



At distances larger than 1 nm, this force is weaker than the gravitational force between two protons

Is there any way to probe this force that has not been explored yet?

Possible answers

To observe a small effect, look for symmetries that this force violates:

The two-neutrino force is the largest long-range parity-violating interaction in the Standard Model

Possible answers

To observe a small effect, look for symmetries that this force violates:

The two-neutrino force is the largest long-range parity-violating interaction in the Standard Model

Look for effects in systems with many neutrinos (finite density backgrounds)

Possible answers

To observe a small effect, look for symmetries that this force violates:

The two-neutrino force is the largest long-range parity-violating interaction in the Standard Model

Spoiler: We find that the effect is tiny

Look for effects in systems with many neutrinos (finite density backgrounds)

Spoiler: We find that the effect is tiny

Observing atomic parity violation in atoms Consider stimulated emission in an atom:

- Electric dipole transitions E1: between states of opposite parity
- Magnetic dipole transitions M1: between states of same parity





Parity is conserved

Observing atomic parity violation in atoms

Consider stimulated emission in an atom:

- Electric dipole transitions E1: between states of opposite parity
- Magnetic dipole transitions M1: between states of same parity

If the Hamiltonian contains a perturbation that violates parity, its eigenstates will contain a small mixture of opposite-parity corrections



Parity is conserved

Parity is violated

Observing atomic parity violation in atoms

Consider stimulated emission in an atom:

- Electric dipole transitions E1 : between states of opposite parity

- Magnetic dipole transitions M1: between states of same parity

If the Hamiltonian contains a perturbation that violates parity, its eigenstates will contain a small mixture of opposite-parity corrections

Optical rotation: Left-polarized and rightpolarized light will refract with different index of refraction in a sample of atomic vapors



$$\Phi = \frac{\pi L}{\lambda} \operatorname{Re}\left(n_{R}(\lambda) + n_{L}(\lambda)\right) \approx \frac{2\pi L}{\lambda} \operatorname{Re}\left(n_{R}(\lambda) + n_{L}(\lambda) - 2\right) R$$
near resonance
$$R \equiv \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{E1_{PV}}{M1}\right)$$

Reviews: Khriplovich (1991), Bouchiat & Bouchiat (1997),...

Assuming a) a static nucleus and b) that the electron velocity is a small parameter, the most general PV-potential is

 $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$

Dobrescu & Mocioiu (2006)

Assuming a) a static nucleus and b) that the electron velocity is a small parameter, the most general PV-potential is

 $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Tree-level} \\ \mathcal{L}_{Z\bar{\psi}\psi} &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{g}{\cos\theta_{W}} \bar{\psi} \left[(g_{V}^{\psi} - g_{A}^{\psi} \gamma^{5}) \mathcal{Z} \psi \right] \\ H_{1} &= H_{1}^{\text{tree}} = \frac{g^{2}}{2 \cos^{2}\theta_{W}} g_{A}^{e} g_{V}^{p}, \\ H_{2} &= H_{2}^{\text{tree}} = \frac{g^{2}}{2 \cos^{2}\theta_{W}} g_{V}^{e} g_{A}^{p}, \\ C &= C^{\text{tree}} = \frac{g^{2}}{2 \cos^{2}\theta_{W}} \frac{g_{V}^{e} g_{A}^{p}}{2m_{e}}, \\ F(r) &= F^{\text{tree}}(r) = \frac{e^{-m_{Z}r}}{4\pi r}. \end{aligned}$$

Assuming a) a static nucleus and b) that the electron velocity is a small parameter, the most general PV-potential is

 $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$

Loop-level: Enter the neutrino force

$$(\mathcal{O}_{Z})_{ij} = -\frac{g^{2}}{8m_{Z}^{2}c_{W}^{2}} [\bar{\psi}\gamma^{\mu}(g_{V}^{\psi} - g_{A}^{\psi}\gamma^{5})\psi]\delta_{ij}[\bar{\nu}_{j}\gamma_{\mu}(1 - \gamma^{5})\nu_{i}] + (\mathcal{O}_{W})_{ij} = -\frac{g^{2}}{8m_{W}^{2}}U_{\alpha j}U_{\alpha i}^{*}[\bar{\psi}\gamma^{\mu}(1 - \gamma^{5})\psi][\bar{\nu}_{j}\gamma_{\mu}(1 - \gamma^{5})\nu_{i}]$$



Assuming a) a static nucleus and b) that the electron velocity is a small parameter, the most general PV-potential is

 $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$

Loop-level: Enter the neutrino force





Parity violating forces in the hydrogen atom $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$ Loop-level $\mathcal{O}_4 = -\frac{G_F}{\sqrt{2}} [\bar{\psi} \gamma^{\mu} (a^{\psi} - b^{\psi} \gamma^5) \psi] [\bar{\nu} \gamma_{\mu} (1 - \gamma^5) \nu]$

$$i\mathcal{M} = -\frac{(-iG_F)^2}{2}\bar{e}\bar{N}\left[\Gamma^e_{\mu}\Gamma^N_{\nu}\right] \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^4k\mathrm{d}^4k'}{(2\pi)^4} \delta^4(q-k-k')\mathrm{Tr}\left[i\Gamma^{\mu}\frac{i(-k'+m)}{k'^2-m^2}i\Gamma^{\nu}\frac{i(k+m)}{k^2-m^2}\right]eN.$$



Parity violating forces in the hydrogen atom $V_{PNC}(r) = H_1 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_e \cdot \vec{v}_e + H_2 F(r) \vec{\sigma}_N \cdot \vec{v}_e + C(\vec{\sigma}_e \times \vec{\sigma}_N) \cdot \vec{\nabla} [F(r)]$ $\mathcal{O}_4 = -\frac{G_F}{\sqrt{2}} [\bar{\psi} \gamma^{\mu} (a^{\psi} - b^{\psi} \gamma^5) \psi] [\bar{\nu} \gamma_{\mu} (1 - \gamma^5) \nu]$

$$i\mathcal{M} = -\frac{(-iG_F)^2}{2}\bar{e}\bar{N}\left[\Gamma^e_{\mu}\Gamma^N_{\nu}\right] \int \frac{\mathrm{d}^4k\mathrm{d}^4k'}{(2\pi)^4} \delta^4(q-k-k')\mathrm{Tr}\left[i\Gamma^{\mu}\frac{i(-k'+m)}{k'^2-m^2}i\Gamma^{\nu}\frac{i(k+m)}{k^2-m^2}\right]eN.$$

$$\underbrace{e^{-}}_{\mu} \underbrace{e^{-}}_{G_{F}} \underbrace{e^{-}}_{V_{PNC}} = V_{PNC}^{loop} \approx \sum_{i} \frac{G_{A}}{m_{e}} \left(-\frac{1}{4} + s_{W}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} |U_{ei}|^{2} \right) \left[(2\vec{\sigma}_{p} \cdot \vec{p}_{e}) V_{\nu_{i}\nu_{i}}(r) + (\vec{\sigma}_{e} \times \vec{\sigma}_{p}) \cdot \vec{\nabla} V_{\nu_{i}\nu_{i}}(r) \right]$$

$$\underbrace{P}_{G_{F}} \underbrace{P}_{G_{F}} \underbrace{V_{\nu\nu} \text{ is computed by taking the Fourier transform of the parity-conserving part of the amplitude (using the Cutkosky cutting rules)}$$

$$V_{\nu\nu}^{\text{Dirac}}(r) = \frac{G_F^2 m_{\nu}^3}{4\pi^3} \frac{K_3(2m_{\nu}r)}{r^2} \qquad V_{\nu\nu}^{\text{Majorana}}(r) = \frac{G_F^2 m_{\nu}^2}{2\pi^3} \frac{K_2(2m_{\nu}r)}{r^3}$$

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

Unperturbed eigenstates

$$\begin{array}{c} |n, f, m_f, j, \ell, s_p, s_e \rangle \\ \\ \hat{H}_0 & \overrightarrow{F} \equiv \overrightarrow{L}_e + \overrightarrow{S}_e + \overrightarrow{S}_p & \overrightarrow{J} \equiv \overrightarrow{L}_e + \overrightarrow{S}_e \end{array}$$

The energy of a state with $f, j, \ell, s_e = s_p = \frac{1}{2}$

$$E_{nfj\ell} = (E_0)_n + (E_{\text{fine}})_{nj} + (E_{\text{hyperfine}})_{nfj\ell}$$

$$(E_0)_n = -\frac{\alpha^2 m_e}{2n^2} \qquad (E_{\text{fine}})_{nj} = -\frac{\alpha^4 m_e}{2n^4} \left(\frac{n}{j+\frac{1}{2}} - \frac{3}{4}\right)$$

$$(E_{\text{hyperfine}})_{nfj\ell} = \frac{\alpha^4 g_p}{m_p} a_0^3 \frac{\ell(\ell+1)m_e^2 \left(f(f+1) - j(j+1) - \frac{3}{4}\right)}{4j(j+1)} \left\langle \frac{1}{r^3} \right\rangle_{n\ell}$$

The only degeneracy remains in m_f

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

We treat $V_{\nu\nu}$ as a perturbation $|\psi_q^1\rangle = |\psi_q^0\rangle + \sum_{p \neq q} \frac{\langle \psi_p^0 | V | \psi_q^0 \rangle}{E_q^0 - E_p^0} |\psi_p^0\rangle$

 $\eta \equiv r/a_0$

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

We treat $V_{\nu\nu}$ as a perturbation $|\psi_q^1\rangle = |\psi_q^0\rangle + \sum_{p \neq q} \frac{\langle \psi_p^0 | V | \psi_q^0 \rangle}{E_q^0 - E_p^0} |\psi_p^0\rangle$

$$\left\langle n\ell m \middle| V_{PNC}^{\text{tree}} \middle| n'\ell'm' \right\rangle \sim \int_0^\infty \mathrm{d}\eta \ \eta^2 \ \eta^{\ell'} V_{PNC}^{\text{tree}}(\eta) \eta^\ell \sim \frac{\alpha^{2\ell+5} m_e^{2\ell+3}}{m_Z^{2\ell+2}} = m_e \alpha^{2\ell+5} \left(\frac{m_e}{m_Z}\right)^{2\ell+2}$$

 $\eta \equiv r/a_0$

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

We treat $V_{\nu\nu}$ as a perturbation $|\psi_q^1\rangle = |\psi_q^0\rangle + \sum_{p \neq q} \frac{\langle \psi_p^0 | V | \psi_q^0 \rangle}{E_q^0 - E_p^0} |\psi_p^0\rangle$

$$\langle n\ell m | V_{PNC}^{\text{tree}} | n'\ell'm' \rangle \sim \int_0^\infty \mathrm{d}\eta \ \eta^2 \ \eta^{\ell'} V_{PNC}^{\text{tree}}(\eta) \eta^\ell \sim \frac{\alpha^{2\ell+5} m_e^{2\ell+3}}{m_Z^{2\ell+2}} = m_e \alpha^{2\ell+5} \left(\frac{m_e}{m_Z}\right)^{2\ell+2}$$
$$\eta \equiv r/a_0$$
$$\langle n\ell m | V_{PNC}^{\text{loop}} | n'\ell'm' \rangle \sim \frac{G_F^2}{m_e a_0^6} \int \mathrm{d}\eta \ \eta^2 \eta^{\ell'} \left(\frac{1}{\eta^6}\right) \eta^\ell \exp\left[-\eta \left(\frac{1}{n} + \frac{1}{n'}\right)\right]$$

for $\ell = 0$ and $\ell = 1$, the radial integral does not converge, indicating the failure of four-Fermi theory

for
$$\ell \ge 2$$

$$\frac{\alpha^2}{m_e m_Z^4 a_0^6} \int_0^\infty \mathrm{d}\eta \ \eta^{2\ell-3} \exp(-n_{sup}\eta) \sim m_e \alpha^8 \left(\frac{m_e}{m_Z}\right)^4 \times (f(\ell) \sim \mathcal{O}(1))$$

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

Let's look now at electric and magnetic transitions: Use states with $\ell = 3$ since they can mix with states with $\ell = 2$ and $\ell = 4$

Our goal: To compute $R \equiv \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{E1_{PV}}{M1}\right)$

 $|A\rangle = |4, 3, 3, 5/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{5/2, F=3}$ $|B\rangle = |4, 3, 3, 7/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{7/2, F=3}$

Before adding $V_{\nu\nu}$, these states have the same ℓ and there can be an M1 transition but not an E1 transition

Ghosh, Grossman & Tangarife PRD (2020)

Let's look now at electric and magnetic transitions: Use states with $\ell = 3$ since they can mix with states with $\ell = 2$ and $\ell = 4$

Our goal: To compute $R \equiv \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{E1_{PV}}{M1}\right)$

 $|A\rangle = |4, 3, 3, 5/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{5/2, F=3}$ $|B\rangle = |4, 3, 3, 7/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{7/2, F=3}$

Before adding $V_{\nu\nu}$, these states have the same ℓ and there can be an M1 transition but not an E1 transition

But now they are corrected

$$|A'\rangle = |A\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta |V_{PNC}|A\rangle}{E_A - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots \qquad |B'\rangle = |B\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta |V_{PNC}|B\rangle}{E_B - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots$$

 $|\Delta\rangle = |4, 3, 3, 5/2, 2\rangle$

Effect of the neutrino fo	orce on the hydrogen atom
$ A\rangle = 4, 3, 3, 5/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{5/2, F=3}$	$ B\rangle = 4, 3, 3, 7/2, 3\rangle \equiv 4F_{7/2, F=3}$
$ A'\rangle = A\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta V_{PNC} A\rangle}{E_A - E_\Delta} \Delta\rangle + \cdots$	$ \Delta\rangle = 4, 3, 3, 5/2, 2\rangle$
$ B'\rangle = B\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta V_{PNC} B \rangle}{E_B - E_\Delta} \Delta\rangle + \cdots$	

$\begin{array}{l} \hline \textit{Effect of the neutrino force on the hydrogen atom} \\ |A\rangle = |4,3,3,5/2,3\rangle \equiv 4F_{5/2,F=3} \\ |B\rangle = |4,3,3,7/2,3\rangle \equiv 4F_{7/2,F=3} \\ |A'\rangle = |A\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta | V_{PNC} | A \rangle}{E_A - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots \\ |B'\rangle = |B\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta | V_{PNC} | B \rangle}{E_B - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots \end{array}$

So we can finally compute

$$R = \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{E1_{PV}}{M1}\right) = \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{\langle A'|\hat{P}|B'\rangle}{\langle A'|\hat{M}|B'\rangle}\right) \approx \left(-\frac{1}{4} + s_W^2 + \frac{1}{2}|U_{ei}|^2\right) \left(-7.7 \times 10^{-33} + 3.7 \times 10^{-32} \left(\frac{m_{\nu_i}}{\alpha m_e}\right)^2\right)$$

The rotation due to the neutrino force would be $\Phi \sim 10^{-32} \, \mathrm{rads}$

$\begin{array}{l} \hline \textbf{Effect of the neutrino force on the hydrogen atom} \\ |A\rangle = |4,3,3,5/2,3\rangle \equiv 4F_{5/2,F=3} \\ |B\rangle = |4,3,3,7/2,3\rangle \equiv 4F_{7/2,F=3} \\ |A'\rangle = |A\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta | V_{PNC} | A \rangle}{E_A - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots \\ |B'\rangle = |B\rangle + \frac{\langle \Delta | V_{PNC} | B \rangle}{E_B - E_\Delta} |\Delta\rangle + \cdots \end{array}$

So we can finally compute

$$R = \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{E1_{PV}}{M1}\right) = \operatorname{Im}\left(\frac{\langle A'|\hat{P}|B'\rangle}{\langle A'|\hat{M}|B'\rangle}\right) \approx \left(-\frac{1}{4} + s_W^2 + \frac{1}{2}|U_{ei}|^2\right) \left(-7.7 \times 10^{-33} + 3.7 \times 10^{-32} \left(\frac{m_{\nu_i}}{\alpha m_e}\right)^2\right)$$

The rotation due to the neutrino force would be $\Phi \sim 10^{-32} \, \mathrm{rads}$

This is about 23 orders of magnitude smaller than what can be measured in the lab (with Cs) Lintz, Guéna & Bouchiat (2006)

Can we probe the neutrino force?

Not yet!

The measurement of optical rotation due to the neutrino loop is extremely challenging given the resolutions we can achieve today.

Neutrino forces in a finite-density background

We move to calculate the neutrino-exchange in the presence of a background of neutrinos Ghosh, Grossman, Tangarife, Xu, Yu JHEP (2022)



Examples: Cosmic neutrino background, Reactor neutrino fluxes

Neutrino forces in a finite-density background

We move to calculate the neutrino-exchange in the presence of a background of neutrinos Ghosh, Grossman, Tangarife, Xu, Yu JHEP (2022)



Examples: Cosmic neutrino background, Reactor neutrino fluxes

We consider backgrounds with a specific direction, e.g. solar, supernova, and reactor neutrinos



Let's assume the neutrino flux is monochromatic (big assumption) $n_{\pm} \left({\bf k} \right) = \left(2\pi \right)^3 \delta^3 \left({\bf k} - {\bf k}_0 \right) \Phi_0$

We consider backgrounds with a specific direction, e.g. solar, supernova, and reactor neutrinos



Let's assume the neutrino flux is monochromatic (big assumption)

$$n_{\pm} \left(\mathbf{k} \right) = \left(2\pi \right)^3 \delta^3 \left(\mathbf{k} - \mathbf{k}_0 \right) \Phi_0$$

$$V(\mathbf{r}) = -\int \frac{d^3\mathbf{q}}{(2\pi)^3} e^{i\mathbf{q}\cdot\mathbf{r}} \mathcal{A}(\mathbf{q})$$

$$i\mathcal{A}(q) = \frac{G_F^2 g_V^1 g_V^2}{2} \int \frac{d^4 k}{(2\pi)^4} \operatorname{Tr} \left[\gamma^0 \left(1 - \gamma_5 \right) S_\nu(k) \gamma^0 \left(1 - \gamma_5 \right) S_\nu(k+q) \right]$$

The resulting background potential at long distance is

 $V_{\text{bkg}}\left(r \gg E_{\nu}^{-1}, \alpha\right) = -\frac{g_V^1 g_V^2}{\pi} G_F^2 \Phi_0 E_{\nu} \frac{1}{r} \left\{ \cos^2\left(\frac{\alpha}{2}\right) \cos\left[\left(1 - \cos\alpha\right) E_{\nu} r\right] + \sin^2\left(\frac{\alpha}{2}\right) \cos\left[\left(1 + \cos\alpha\right) E_{\nu} r\right] \right\}$



In the limit $r \gg E_{\nu}^{-1}, \alpha \ll 1$,

$$V_{\rm bkg} = -\frac{g_V^1 g_V^2}{\pi} G_F^2 \times \Phi_0 E_\nu \times \frac{1}{r} \times \cos\left(\frac{\alpha^2 E_\nu r}{2}\right)$$



The resulting background potential at long distance is

 $V_{\rm bkg}\left(r \gg E_{\nu}^{-1}, \alpha\right) = -\frac{g_V^1 g_V^2}{\pi} G_F^2 \Phi_0 E_{\nu} \frac{1}{r} \left\{\cos^2\left(\frac{\alpha}{2}\right) \cos\left[\left(1 - \cos\alpha\right) E_{\nu} r\right] + \sin^2\left(\frac{\alpha}{2}\right) \cos\left[\left(1 + \cos\alpha\right) E_{\nu} r\right]\right\}$



In the limit $r \gg E_{\nu}^{-1}, \alpha \ll 1$,

$$V_{\rm bkg} = -\frac{g_V^1 g_V^2}{\pi} G_F^2 \times \Phi_0 E_\nu \times \frac{1}{r} \times \cos\left(\frac{\alpha^2 E_\nu r}{2}\right)$$

Taking into account finite size and energy spread,

$$\alpha^2 \lesssim \frac{\pi}{\Delta(E_\nu r)}$$



Can we probe this force with experiments?



sensitivities

Can we probe this force with experiments?



Can we probe the neutrino force?

Not yet!

The measurement of optical rotation due to the neutrino loop is extremely challenging given the resolutions we can achieve today.

Nonetheless, this calculation, performed for other systems, could lead to somewhat larger quantities and the next step would most likely be an application of this idea to many-electron atoms, beyond the simple hydrogen case. The matrix elements in these atoms are amplified by an additional Z^3 factor.

On the other hand, a strong neutrino background could significantly enhance neutrino forces. In particular, in the small- α limit, the force could be behave as 1/r even in the long-range regime.

The neutrino force in the solar or reactor neutrino background is much more experimentally accessible than the one in vacuum. Dedicated experimental efforts are called for to check if these enhancement factors can be exploit in order to detect the elusive neutrino force.

Thank you!

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{k}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle 0 | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle 0 | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle$$

$$\text{Replace} \quad |0\rangle \rightarrow |w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} w(\mathbf{p}) a_{\mathbf{p}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle , \ \langle w | w \rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} |w(\mathbf{p})|^2 \equiv 1$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-i\mathbf{p}\cdot\mathbf{x}+i\mathbf{k}\cdot\mathbf{y}} \langle 0|a_{\mathbf{p}}a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger}|0\rangle$$

$$\mathsf{Replace} \quad |0\rangle \rightarrow |w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} w(\mathbf{p}) a_{\mathbf{p}}^{\dagger}|0\rangle , \ \langle w|w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} |w(\mathbf{p})|^2 \equiv 1$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle w | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | w \rangle \propto -\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p})$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{k}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle 0 | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle$$

$$\text{Replace} \quad |0\rangle \rightarrow |w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} w(\mathbf{p}) a_{\mathbf{p}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle , \ \langle w | w \rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} |w(\mathbf{p})|^2 \equiv 1$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle w | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | w \rangle \propto -\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p})$$

$$w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p}) \xrightarrow{\text{smearing}} \frac{1}{V} \int w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p})e^{i(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})\cdot\Delta\mathbf{x}}d^{3}\Delta\mathbf{x} = \frac{(2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})}{V}|w(\mathbf{p})|^{2}$$
$$= (2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})n_{+}(\mathbf{p})$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-i\mathbf{p}\cdot x + i\mathbf{k}\cdot y} \langle 0|a_{\mathbf{p}}a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger}|0\rangle$$

$$\text{Replace} \quad |0\rangle \rightarrow |w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} w(\mathbf{p}) a_{\mathbf{p}}^{\dagger}|0\rangle , \ \langle w|w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} |w(\mathbf{p})|^2 \equiv 1$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle w | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | w \rangle \propto -\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p})$$

$$w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p}) \xrightarrow{\text{smearing}} \frac{1}{V} \int w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p})e^{i(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})\cdot\Delta\mathbf{x}}d^{3}\Delta\mathbf{x} = \frac{(2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})}{V}|w(\mathbf{p})|^{2}$$
$$= (2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})n_{+}(\mathbf{p})$$

$$-\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p}) \xrightarrow{\text{smearing}} -\int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{e^{-ip \cdot (x-y)}}{2E_{\mathbf{p}}} n_+(\mathbf{p})$$
$$= -\int \frac{d^4 p}{(2\pi)^4} e^{-ip \cdot (x-y)} (2\pi) \delta\left(p^2 - m^2\right) \Theta\left(p^0\right) n_+(\mathbf{p})$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle 0 | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle$$

$$\mathsf{Replace} \quad |0\rangle \rightarrow |w\rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} w(\mathbf{p}) a_{\mathbf{p}}^{\dagger} | 0 \rangle, \ \langle w | w \rangle = \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} |w(\mathbf{p})|^2 \equiv 1$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2E_{\mathbf{p}}}} e^{-ip \cdot x + ik \cdot y} \langle w | a_{\mathbf{p}} a_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} | w \rangle \propto -\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p})$$

$$w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p}) \xrightarrow{\text{smearing}} \frac{1}{V} \int w^{*}(\mathbf{k})w(\mathbf{p})e^{i(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})\cdot\Delta\mathbf{x}}d^{3}\Delta\mathbf{x} = \frac{(2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})}{V}|w(\mathbf{p})|^{2}$$
$$= (2\pi)^{3}\delta^{3}(\mathbf{p}-\mathbf{k})n_{+}(\mathbf{p})$$

$$-\int_{\mathbf{pk}} w^*(\mathbf{k}) w(\mathbf{p}) \xrightarrow{\text{smearing}} -\int \frac{d^3 \mathbf{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \frac{e^{-ip \cdot (x-y)}}{2E_{\mathbf{p}}} n_+(\mathbf{p})$$
$$= -\int \frac{d^4 p}{(2\pi)^4} e^{-ip \cdot (x-y)} (2\pi) \delta\left(p^2 - m^2\right) \Theta\left(p^0\right) n_+(\mathbf{p})$$

$$S_F \propto \int \frac{d^4 p}{(2\pi)^4} e^{-ip \cdot (x-y)} \left\{ \frac{i}{p^2 - m^2 + i\epsilon} - (2\pi)\delta\left(p^2 - m^2\right)\Theta\left(p^0\right)n_+(\mathbf{p}) \right\}$$