Reconstruction Approximants to Hadronic Vacuum Polarization and the MUonE proposal

David Greynat

The Evaluation of the Leading Hadronic Contribution to the Muon g-2: Towards the MUonE Experiment – 17^{th} Nov. 2022

In collaboration with Eduardo de Rafael

Based on D.G. and E. de Rafael, arXiv [hep-ph] 2202.10810, JHEP 05 (2022) 084

T. Aoyama et al. (Muon g-2 Theory Initiative), Phys. Rep. 887 1 (2020) = White Paper (2020).

From the new experimental average value FNAL (2021),

 $a_{\mu}^{\text{exp.}} = 116\,592\,061(41)\cdot 10^{-11}(0.35\,\text{ppm})$

there is a persistent discrepancy of 4.2σ with the SM evaluation WP (2020)

$$\Delta a_{\mu} = a_{\mu}^{\text{exp.}} - a_{\mu}^{\text{SM}} = (251 \pm 59) \cdot 10^{-11}$$

HVP-LO	6933 ± 25	A. Keshavarzi <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	6931 ± 40	White Paper (2020)
HVP-NLO	-99.3 ± 7	F. Jegerlehner (2017)
	-98.7 ± 7	White Paper (2020)
HVP-NNLO	$+12.2 \pm 1$	F. Jegerlehner (2017)
	$+12.4 \pm 1$	White Paper (2020)
HLbL	$+105 \pm 26$	J. Prades et al. (2009)
	$+92 \pm 18$	White Paper (2020)
EW	153.6 ± 1	White Paper (2020)

All in 10^{-11} units

The evaluation of the HVP-LO is the most important to consider

HVP contribution to the anomaly

HVP and a_{μ}

The two-point VV correlator Π obeys to a one sub. disp. rep. $Q^2=-(q^2=t)>0$

$$\mathbf{n} = \Pi(-Q^2) = \int_{4m_{\pi}^2}^{\infty} \frac{\mathrm{d}t}{t} \left[\frac{-Q^2}{t+Q^2} \right] \frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im}\,\Pi(t)$$

which gives a contribution

$$a_{\mu}^{\mathsf{HVP}} = \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \int_{4m_{\pi}^{2}}^{\infty} \frac{\mathrm{d}t}{t} \underbrace{\int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}x \frac{x^{2}(1-x)}{x^{2} + \frac{t}{m_{\mu}^{2}}(1-x)}}_{\doteq K\left(\frac{t}{m_{\mu}^{2}}\right)} \frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} \, \Pi(t)$$

Determination of a_{μ}^{HVP}

$$\begin{split} a_{\mu}^{\mathsf{HVP}} &= \int_{0}^{1} \! \mathrm{d}x(1-x) \int_{4m_{\pi}^{2}}^{\infty} \frac{\mathrm{d}t}{t} \left[\frac{\frac{x^{2}}{1-x}m_{\mu}^{2}}{1-x}m_{\mu}^{2} \right] \frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im}\,\Pi(t) \quad \longleftarrow \sigma[e\overline{e} \xrightarrow{\gamma^{*}}_{\gamma^{*}} \,_{\mathsf{Hadr}}](t) = \frac{4\pi^{2}\alpha}{t} \mathrm{Im}\,\Pi(t) \\ &= -\int_{0}^{1} \! \mathrm{d}x\,(1-x)\,\Pi\left(-\frac{x^{2}}{1-x}m_{\mu}^{2}\right) \qquad \qquad \longleftarrow \mathsf{Euclidean representation} \end{split}$$

C. Bouchiat and L. Michel (1961); B. Lautrup and E. de Rafael (1969); E. de Rafael (1994)

The new Lattice QCD result on a_{μ}^{HVP} – BMW (2021)

Sz. Borsanyi et al., Nature 593 51 (2021)

LQCD reconstructs the Euclidean part $\Pi(-Q^2)$ and gives

 $a_{\mu}^{\mathsf{HVP}}(\mathsf{BMW}) = (7075 \pm 55) \cdot 10^{-11}$

which differs by 2.1σ of the WP evaluation $a_{\mu}^{\rm HVP}({\rm WP})=(6845\pm40)\cdot10^{-11}$ and

 $\Delta a_{\mu} = a_{\mu}^{\text{exp.}} - a_{\mu}^{\text{SM}}(\text{BMW}) = (21 \pm 30) \cdot 10^{-11}$

which is a difference of 1.6σ (for the WP is 4.2σ).

Confirmed by:

M. Cé et al., arXiv:2206.06582 [hep-lat]

C. Alexandrou et al., arXiv:2206.15084 [hep-lat]

Conclusion

It is clearly important to understand this discrepancy both theoretically and experimentally.

The MUonE proposal at the SPSC at CERN

G. Abbiendi et al. Letter of Intent: The MUonE Project, CERN-SPSC-2019-026 / SPSC-I-252 (2019)

Measuring the hadronic contribution to the Bhabha scattering $e\mu
ightarrow e\mu$



and $s-Q^2+u=2m_e^2+2m_\mu^2,\,s=2m_eE_\mu+m_\mu^2+m_e^2,\,\lambda$ is the Källen function



$$a_{\mu}^{\mathsf{HVP}} = -\int_{0}^{1} \mathrm{d}x \; (1-x) \; \Pi\left(-\frac{x^{2}}{1-x}m_{\mu}^{2}\right)$$

The expected range of measurements

 $0.23 \leqslant x \leqslant 0.93$

This area represents at the best 87% of the total value.

We need an efficient extrapolation of Π !

HVP structure and expansions



From A. Keshavarzi et al. Phys. Rev. D 97 (2018)

- The anomaly requires to know:
 - $\Pi(-Q^2)$ for $0 < Q^2 < \infty$
 - Or $\operatorname{Im} \Pi(q^2)$ for $t_0 < q^2 < \infty$.
- This is equivalent to know all the moments $\mathcal{M}(1-n)$.
- We are looking for an extrapolation method which satisfies the analytic properties of QCD

A mathematical interlude

Flajolet and Odlyzko's transfer theorem

Ph. Flajolet and A.M. Odlyzko, SIAM Journal Discrete Math.3 2 216 (1990)

Ph. Flajolet and R. Sedgewick, Analytic Combinatorics, Cambridge University Press, (2009)

Transfer Theorem

"The asymptotic expansion of a function near its dominant singularities provides the asymptotic expansion of the function's coefficients."

Assume that $f\colon \mathbf{C}\to \mathbf{C}$ is analytic inside the unit disc,

$$f(z) = \sum_{|z|<1} \sum_{n=1} f_n z^n ,$$

 $\xrightarrow{0} 1 \operatorname{Re} z$

 $\operatorname{Im} z$

and at $z=1,\,f$ has the singular behaviour – $(\alpha,\beta)\in {\bf C}^2$

$$f(z) \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} (1-z)^{\alpha} \ln^{\beta} (1-z)$$

then the transfer theorem states

$$f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{\mathrm{AS}} \doteq \frac{\ln^{\beta - 1} n}{n^{\alpha + 1}} \sum_{k = -|\lfloor \alpha + 1\rfloor|}^{\infty} \frac{P_k(\ln n)}{n^k}$$

where P_k are polynomials.

Transfer Theorem: some examples

Ph. Flajolet and A.M. Odlyzko, SIAM Journal Discrete Math.3 2 216 (1990)

Ph. Flajolet and R. Sedgewick, Analytic Combinatorics, Cambridge University Press, (2009)

Some examples how the *transfer* works

$$\begin{split} f(z) & \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} \frac{1}{1-z} & \longmapsto & f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{AS} = 1 \\ f(z) & \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} \frac{1}{(1-z)^2} & \longmapsto & f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{AS} = n+1 \\ f(z) & \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} \sqrt{1-z} & \longmapsto & f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{AS} = -\frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \left[\frac{1}{n^2} + \frac{3}{8} \frac{1}{n^3} + \cdots \right] \\ f(z) & \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} = \frac{1}{1-z} \ln \left(\frac{1}{1-z} \right) & \longmapsto & f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{AS} = \ln n + \gamma_E + \frac{1}{2n} + \cdots \\ f(z) & \underset{z \to 1}{\sim} (1-z)^m \ln \left(\frac{1}{1-z} \right) & \longmapsto & f_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} f_n^{AS} = \frac{(-1)^m \Gamma(1+m)}{n^{m+1}} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \left\{ \begin{array}{c} m+k \\ m \end{array} \right\} \frac{1}{n^k} \end{split}$$

for any m positive integers and $\{:\}$ Stirling numbers of 2nd kind.

Reconstruction Approximants

Reconstruction approximants

From the exact equality

$$f(z) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} f_n z^n = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \underbrace{(f_n - f_n^{AS})}_{=\mathcal{A}_n} z^n + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} f_n^{AS} z^n$$

where the f_n^{AS} are given by the *transfer theorem*, then f can be approximated by

$$f(z) \approx f_N(z) \doteq \sum_{n=1}^N \mathcal{A}_n z^n + \sum_{n=1}^\infty f_n^{AS} z^n$$

where \mathcal{A}_n are treated as free parameters. The *local systematic error* is then

$$\mathcal{E}_N(z) = \sum_{n=N+1}^{\infty} \mathcal{A}_n z^r$$

Moreover

if
$$f_n^{AS} = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \frac{\mathcal{B}_\ell}{n^\ell}$$
 then $\sum_{n=1}^\infty f_n^{AS} z^n = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \mathcal{B}_\ell \sum_{n=1}^\infty \frac{z^n}{n^\ell} = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \mathcal{B}_\ell \operatorname{Li}_\ell(z)$

where the ${\rm Li}_\ell$ are the Polylogarithm functions. Therefore

$$f(z) \approx f_{N,L}(z) \doteq \sum_{n=1}^{N} \mathcal{A}_n z^n + \sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \mathcal{B}_\ell \operatorname{Li}_\ell(z)$$

One can show that $f_{N,L}(z) \xrightarrow[N \to \infty]{} f(z)$ and $f_{N,L}(z) \xrightarrow[L \to \infty]{} f(z)$

How apply reconstruction approximants to HVP?

How to transfert asymptotic expansions of II to its moments $\mathcal{M}(1-n)$? By a conformal change of variable,

$$\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}} = \frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^{2}} \iff \omega = \begin{cases} \frac{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}-1}{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}+1} & \text{when } \frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}} > -1\\ \frac{i\sqrt{\tau-1}+1}{\sqrt{\tau-1-1}} & \text{when } \frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}} = -\tau < -1 \end{cases}$$

∏ becomes

$$\Pi(-Q^2) = \sum_{|Q^2| < t_0}^{\infty} \mathcal{M}(1-n) \left(-\frac{Q^2}{t_0}\right)^n \iff \Pi\left(-\frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^2}\right) = \sum_{|\omega| < 1}^{\infty} \Omega_n \omega^n$$

The *reconstruction approximants* can be applied to Π as a function of ω .

Taylor expansion

The Taylor expansion at $\omega = 0$ is known since Ω_n are a linear combination of the moments $\mathcal{M}(1-n)$,

$$\mathcal{M}(1-n) = \frac{4^{-n}}{n} \sum_{k=1}^{n} {2n \choose n-k} k \Omega_k \iff \Omega_n = \sum_{p=1}^{n} {n+p-1 \choose 2p-1} \mathcal{M}(1-p)(-4)^p$$

The large Q^2 expansion

The generic large Q^2 expansion of Π in perturbative QCD is

$$\Pi(-Q^2) \underset{\substack{Q^2 \to \infty \\ k \ge 0}}{\sim} \sum_{\substack{p \ge 1 \\ k \ge 0}} \frac{(-1)^k}{k!} \mathcal{R}_{p,k} \left(\frac{Q^2}{t_0}\right)^{1-p} \ln^k \left(\frac{Q^2}{t_0}\right)$$

where the first coefficient is $\mathcal{R}_{1,1} = \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \frac{N_c}{3} \sum e_{\mathsf{quarks}}^2 = \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \frac{5}{3}$

In our case we take k=0,1 (compatible with all known phenomenological models in particular sum of Breit-Wigner's resonances)

$$\Pi\left(-\frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^2}\right) \underset{\omega\to 1}{\sim} \sum_{m\geq 0} \tilde{\mathcal{R}}_{m,1} \left(1-\omega\right)^m \ln\left(\frac{1}{1-\omega}\right) ,$$

The transfer theorem gives

$$\Omega_n \underset{n \to \infty}{\sim} \Omega_n^{\rm AS} = \sum_{\ell \geqslant 0} \frac{\mathcal{B}_\ell}{n^\ell}$$

where $\mathcal{B}_1 = -2\mathcal{R}_{1,1}$ and \mathcal{B}_{ℓ} are a linear combination of the $\mathcal{R}_{p,1}$, with $\mathcal{B}_{2k} = 0$.

Spectral function

On the circle $|\omega|=1,$ we are moving on the cut $1< au\doteq rac{q^2}{t_0}<\infty,$

$$\operatorname{Im} \Pi \left(\tau = \frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^2} \right) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n \sin(n \arg \omega) = -\frac{2\sqrt{\tau-1}}{\tau} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n \operatorname{U}_{n-1} \left(1 - \frac{2}{\tau} \right)$$

where U_n are the Chebyshev polynomials of the 2nd kind. One gets the threshold expansion

$$\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} \Pi(\tau) \underset{\tau \to 1}{\sim} \left[\frac{2}{\pi} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n n (-1)^n \right] \sqrt{\tau - 1} + \left[-\frac{2}{3\pi} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n n (1 + 2n^2) (-1)^n \right] (\tau - 1)^{\frac{3}{2}}$$

According to Chiral Perturbation Theory,

$$\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} \Pi(\tau) \underset{\tau \to 1}{\sim} \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \frac{1}{12} |F_{\pi}(t_0)|^2 (\tau - 1)^{\frac{3}{2}}$$

 $F_{\pi}(t_0)$ is the e.m. form factor of the pion at the threshold. By identification, we have the *two constraints*

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n n (-1)^n = 0 \text{ and } -\frac{4}{3\pi} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \Omega_n n^3 (-1)^n = \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \frac{1}{12} |F_{\pi}(t_0)|^2$$

Reconstruction Approximants of the HVP

The reconstruction approximants are

$$\Pi_N\left(-\frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^2}\right) = \sum_{n=1}^N \underbrace{(\Omega_n - \Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}})}_{=\mathcal{A}_n} \omega^n + \sum_{n=1}^\infty \Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}} \omega^n$$

From the transfer theorem we know that

$$\Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}} = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \frac{\mathcal{B}_\ell}{n^\ell} \implies \sum_{n=1}^\infty \Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}} \omega^n = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \mathcal{B}_\ell \sum_{n=1}^\infty \frac{\omega^n}{n^\ell} = \sum_{\ell=1}^L \mathcal{B}_\ell \operatorname{Li}_\ell(\omega)$$

where the Li_ℓ are the Polylogarithm functions.

Reconstruction Approximants of the HVP

The Euclidean *reconstruction approximants* of the HVP are given by

$$\Pi\left(-Q^{2}\right) \approx \Pi_{N,L}\left(-Q^{2}\right) = \sum_{n=1}^{N} \mathcal{A}_{n}\left(\frac{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}-1}{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}+1}\right)^{n} + \sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \mathcal{B}_{\ell} \operatorname{Li}_{\ell}\left(\frac{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}-1}{\sqrt{1+\frac{Q^{2}}{t_{0}}}+1}\right)^{n}$$

with the constraints

$$\sum_{n=1}^{N} \mathcal{A}_n n(-1)^n - \sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \mathcal{B}_\ell \operatorname{Li}_{\ell-1}(-1) = 0$$
$$\sum_{n=1}^{N} \mathcal{A}_n n^3 (-1)^n - \sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \mathcal{B}_\ell \operatorname{Li}_{\ell-3}(-1) = -\frac{3\pi}{4} \cdot \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \frac{1}{12} |F_\pi(t_0)|^2$$

A first example

QCD asymptotic Freedom fixes: $\mathcal{B}_1 = (-2)\frac{\alpha}{5}\frac{5}{3}$ and *lowest order* χPT fixes $|F_{\pi}(t_0)|^2 = 1$. The two constraints give $\mathcal{A}_1 = 2.156$ and $\mathcal{A}_2 = 0.2450$



The anomaly

Using this first simple reconstruction approximant, we have a value for the anomaly

$$a_{\mu}^{\rm HVP}(N=2) = 6527.12 \cdot 10^{-11}$$

which is already at a level of 6% error from the WP prediction.

Reconstruction approximants of HVP and the MUonE proposal

Phenomenological toy-model

We consider the spectral function

$$\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} \Pi_{\text{model}}^{\text{HVP}}(t) = \frac{\alpha}{\pi} \left(1 - \frac{4m_{\pi}^2}{t} \right)^{3/2} \left\{ \frac{1}{12} |F(t)|^2 + \sum_{q \in \text{quarks}} e_q^2 \; \Theta(t, t_c, \Delta) \right\} \vartheta(t - 4m_{\pi}^2)$$

It has a Breit-Wigner-like modulous squared form factor

$$|F(t)|^2 = \frac{M_{\rho}^4}{(M_{\rho}^2 - t)^2 + M_{\rho}^2 \Gamma(t)^2} ,$$

with an energy dependent width:

$$\Gamma(t) = \frac{M_{\rho}t}{96\pi f_{\pi}^2} \left[\left(1 - \frac{4m_{\pi}^2}{t} \right)^{3/2} \vartheta(t - 4m_{\pi}^2) + \frac{1}{2} \left(1 - \frac{4M_K^2}{t} \right)^{3/2} \vartheta(t - 4M_K^2) \right] ;$$

plus a function

$$\Theta(t, t_c, \Delta) = \frac{\frac{2}{\pi} \arctan\left(\frac{t - t_c}{\Delta}\right) - \frac{2}{\pi} \arctan\left(\frac{t_0 - t_c}{\Delta}\right)}{1 - \frac{2}{\pi} \arctan\left(\frac{t_0 - t_c}{\Delta}\right)}$$

with two arbitrary parameters t_c and Δ .

Phenomenological toy-model ($t_c = 1 \text{ GeV}^2$, $\Delta = 0.5 \text{ GeV}^2$)



This toy-model gives an anomaly:

 $a_{\mu}^{\rm HVP}({\sf Model}) = 6992.4 \cdot 10^{-11}$

Procedure

1. To mimic the data points of MUonE, we consider 50 points equally spaced without "experimental errors" in the range $0.23 \le x \le 0.93$

2. We do linear fits of the parameters A_n in the reconstruction approximants formula for $\prod_{N,L} (-Q^2)$.

Fits # 1

We take L = 1 with the condition $\mathcal{B}_1 = (-2)\frac{\alpha}{\pi}\frac{5}{3}$



Fits # 2

We take L = 5 with the condition $\mathcal{B}_1 = (-2)\frac{\alpha}{\pi}\frac{5}{3}$, \mathcal{B}_3 and \mathcal{B}_5 fixed by constraints but $|F_{\pi}(t_0)|^2$ as fitted parameter.



Conclusion

- We have built reconstruction approximants to HVP in the Euclidean region using the Flajolet and Odlyzko's transfert theorem. This approximation method
 - is valid for any value of Q^2 .
 - preserves the analytic structure (cuts,...) contrary to Padé approximants.
- Well adapted to the MUonE experimental proposal.
- The method can be improved by adding more approximants.
- We are working on adapting the method to Lattice QCD evaluations of the Time Momentum Representation of HVP.

Backup slides

Relations on coefficients

From the Mellin singular expansion

$$\mathcal{M}(s) \asymp \sum_{\substack{p \ge 1\\k \ge 0}} \frac{(-1)^p \mathcal{R}_{p,k}}{(s-p)^{k+1}}$$

we get

$$\Pi(-Q^2) \underset{\substack{Q^2 \to \infty \\ k \ge 0}}{\sim} \sum_{\substack{p \ge 1 \\ k \ge 0}} \frac{(-1)^k}{k!} \mathcal{R}_{p,k} \left(\frac{Q^2}{t_0}\right)^{1-p} \ln^k \left(\frac{Q^2}{t_0}\right)$$

which becomes for k = 0, 1 in the conformal plane

$$\Pi\left(-\frac{4\omega}{(1-\omega)^2}\right) \underset{\substack{\omega \to 1}{\sim}}{\sim} \sum_{\substack{m \ge 0}} \tilde{\mathcal{R}}_{m,1} \left(1-\omega\right)^m \ln\left(\frac{1}{1-\omega}\right)$$

where we have the explicit expressions

$$\widetilde{\mathcal{R}}_{0,1} = -2\mathcal{R}_{1,1} \text{ and } \widetilde{\mathcal{R}}_{m,1} = -2\sum_{\mathsf{p}=2}^{\lfloor \frac{m+2}{2} \rfloor} \binom{m-\mathsf{p}}{\mathsf{p}-2} 4^{1-\mathsf{p}}\mathcal{R}_{\mathsf{p},1} \text{ for } m \ge 1$$

And the transfert theorem leads to

$$\Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}} = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m \ge 0} \widetilde{\mathcal{R}}_{m,1} \begin{Bmatrix} m+j \\ m \end{Bmatrix} \frac{(-1)^m \Gamma(m+1)}{n^{m+1+j}}$$

which can be rewritten as

$$\Omega_n^{\mathrm{AS}} = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{\mathcal{B}_l}{n^l} \quad \text{where } \mathcal{B}_1 = -2\mathcal{R}_{1,1} \quad \text{and } \mathcal{B}_l = \sum_{m=1}^{l-1} \widetilde{\mathcal{R}}_{m,1} \left\{ \begin{matrix} l-1 \\ m \end{matrix} \right\} (-1)^m \Gamma(m+1) \ .$$

Comments on errors and efficiency



This just an illustrative example to show the stability and the efficiency *a posteriori* of the reconstruction approximants.

Systematic error

There are several ways to estimate the systematic error

$$\mathcal{E}_N(\omega) = \sum_{n=N+1}^{\infty} \mathcal{A}_n \omega^n$$

but it must be discussed in the context of the MUonE experiment and adapted.

